

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

In Re: Methyl Tertiary Butyl Ether ("MTBE")
Products Liability Litigation

-X

Master File C.A. No. 1:00-1898
MDL 1358 (SAS)

This document pertains to:
City of New York v. Amerada Hess, et al.,
No. 04 Civ. 3417

GABRIEL W. GORENSTEIN, United States Magistrate Judge

-X

USDC SDNY
DOCUMENT
ELECTRONICALLY FILED
DOC #: _____
DATE FILED: <u>1/20/09</u>

The rulings on the parties' objections to the deposition excerpts that have been designated for use at trial — except as to relevance* — are set forth below.

Witness: Nainan, Meena

<u>Tab</u>	<u>Pages/Lines</u>	<u>Ruling</u>
1	48: 14 - 24	Ruling on relevance deferred.
2	49: 7 - 50: 11	Ruling on relevance deferred.
3	55: 11 - 23	Overruled with respect to any objection not based on relevance; ruling on relevance deferred.
4	61: 4 - 10	Ruling on relevance deferred.
	61: 11 - 62: 4	Overruled.
5	62: 5 - 8	Ruling on relevance deferred.
	62: 9 - 21	Ruling on relevance deferred.
6	69: 4 - 17	Overruled.
	69: 18 - 23	Overruled.
7	70: 18 - 71: 9	Ruling on relevance deferred.

* Judge Scheindlin will determine objections as to relevance at the time testimony is offered at trial.

8	72: 2 - 19	Ruling on relevance deferred.
	72: 25 - 73: 10	Ruling on relevance deferred.
9	75: 3 - 8	Ruling on relevance deferred.
10	76: 1 - 4	Ruling on relevance deferred.
11	77: 2 - 9	Ruling on relevance deferred.
12	81: 8 - 17	Ruling on relevance deferred.
13	82: 6 - 8	Ruling on relevance deferred.
14	83: 13 - 21	Ruling on relevance deferred.
	83: 22 - 84: 4	Ruling on relevance deferred.
15	84: 12 - 19	Ruling on relevance deferred.
16	85: 4 - 86: 16	Ruling on relevance deferred.
17	92: 1 - 13	Ruling on relevance deferred.
18	94: 1 - 4	Ruling on relevance deferred.
	94: 14 - 23	Ruling on relevance deferred.
	94: 24 - 95: 9	Ruling on relevance deferred.
19	97: 9 -13	Ruling on relevance deferred.
20	101: 20 - 102: 8	Overruled.
	102: 14 - 20	Overruled.
21	106: 8 - 25	Sustained.

22	107: 1 - 3	Overruled.
	107: 4 - 11	Overruled.
	107: 12 - 14	Overruled.
	107: 15 - 17	Overruled.
	107: 23 - 108: 2	Overruled.
	108: 3 - 16	Overruled.
23	112: 2 - 15	Overruled.
	112: 16 - 25	Overruled.
24	113: 10 - 20	Overruled.
25	118: 10 - 14	Overruled.
	118: 24 - 119:10	Overruled.
26	120: 8 - 13	Overruled.
	120: 14 - 20	Overruled.
27	132: 6 - 15	Overruled with respect to any objection not based on relevance; ruling on relevance deferred.
	132: 24 - 133:01	Overruled.
28	133: 20 - 25	Overruled.
29	134: 1 - 6	Overruled.
	134:19 - 24	Overruled.
30	141: 24 - 142: 11	Sustained.
31	143: 15 - 24	Overruled.
32	158: 11 - 22	Overruled.
	158: 23 - 159: 10	Overruled.

33	160: 3 - 11	Sustained.
	160: 12 - 23	Overruled.
	161: 3 - 16	Overruled.
	161: 17 - 22	Overruled.
34	163: 20 - 24	Overruled.
35	173: 6 - 15	Sustained (without the need to reach the issue of relevance).
36	179: 24 - 180: 7	Overruled.
37	181: 10 - 182: 1	Overruled with respect to any objection not based on relevance; ruling on relevance deferred.
38	182: 2 - 10	Overruled with respect to any objection not based on relevance; ruling on relevance deferred.
	182: 11 - 13	Overruled.
	182: 14 - 24	Ruling on relevance deferred.
	183: 2 - 4	Ruling on relevance deferred.
	183: 13 - 25	Sustained
39	188: 22 - 189: 12	Ruling on relevance deferred.
	189: 13 - 15	Overruled with respect to any objection not based on relevance; ruling on relevance deferred.
	189: 16 - 24	Overruled with respect to any objection not based on relevance; ruling on relevance deferred.
	189:25 - 190: 25	Ruling on relevance deferred.

40	192: 16 - 19	Ruling on relevance deferred.
	192: 20 - 193: 2	Ruling on relevance deferred
	193: 9 - 13	Overruled.
	193: 14 - 25	Ruling on relevance deferred.
41	195: 7 - 12	Ruling on relevance deferred.
	195: 13 - 17	Ruling on relevance deferred
	195: 18 - 21	Ruling on relevance deferred
	195: 22 - 196: 4	Ruling on relevance deferred
	196: 5 - 13	Overruled with respect to any objection not based on relevance; ruling on relevance deferred.
	196: 14 - 20	Overruled with respect to any objection not based on relevance; ruling on relevance deferred.
	196: 21 - 197: 1	Overruled with respect to any objection not based on relevance; ruling on relevance deferred.
	197: 2 - 6	Ruling on relevance deferred.
	197: 7 - 10	Ruling on relevance deferred.
	197: 11 - 12	Ruling on relevance deferred.
	197: 13 - 16	Overruled with respect to any objection not based on relevance; ruling on relevance deferred.
	197: 17 - 20	Overruled with respect to any objection not based on relevance; ruling on relevance deferred.

42	198: 18 - 200: 4	Overruled with respect to any objection not based on relevance; ruling on relevance deferred.
	200: 5 - 14	Ruling on relevance deferred.
	200: 15 - 24	Ruling on relevance deferred.
	200: 25 - 201: 7	Ruling on relevance deferred.
43	202: 18 - 24	Overruled with respect to any objection not based on relevance; ruling on relevance deferred.
44	205: 5 - 11	Overruled.
	205: 12 - 22	Overruled.
	205:23 - 206: 9	Overruled.
45	207: 11 - 19	Overruled.
	207: 20 - 22	Overruled.
	207: 23 - 208: 8	Overruled.
	208: 9 - 12	Sustained.
46	209: 1 - 8	Overruled.
	209: 19 - 210: 6	Ruling on relevance deferred.
	210: 7 - 15	Ruling on relevance deferred.
47	211: 8 - 11, 14-17	Overruled with respect to any objection not based on relevance; ruling on relevance deferred.
	211: 18 - 212: 4	Overruled with respect to any objection not based on relevance; ruling on relevance deferred.
	212: 5 - 10	Overruled with respect to any objection not based on relevance; ruling on relevance deferred.

48	213: 1 - 23	Overruled with respect to any objection not based on relevance; ruling on relevance deferred.
49	216: 2 - 9	Overruled.
	216: 10 - 15	Overruled.
50	218: 4 - 7	Overruled with respect to any objection not based on relevance; ruling on relevance deferred.
	218: 8 - 18	Overruled with respect to any objection not based on relevance; ruling on relevance deferred.
	218: 19 - 219: 1	Overruled with respect to any objection not based on relevance; ruling on relevance deferred.
51	220: 17 - 221: 7	Ruling on relevance deferred.
	221: 8 - 20	Ruling on relevance deferred.
	221: 21 - 222: 4	Ruling on relevance deferred.
52	223: 10 - 224: 4	Overruled.
	224: 5 - 10	Overruled.
53	227: 9 - 11	Overruled.
	227: 12 - 228: 18	Overruled.
54	230: 6 - 18	Overruled.

SO ORDERED.

Dated: July 20, 2009
 New York, New York



GABRIEL W. GORENSTEIN
 United States Magistrate Judge